

WEST COAST ROCK LOBSTER MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS - ZONE A

APP NO	APPELLANT NAME	AdCom 1	AdCom 2	IMPROPER LODGEMENTS	MATERIAL DEFECTS	ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT	PQR Risk	COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA																				TOTAL	DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED IN	REASONS	APPEAL															
								Investment	Jobs	N	Transformation	Historical	Compliance	Reliance	Investment	Performance	Transformation Score	Compliance	Reliance	Reliance	TOTAL	Appeal Submitted	Grounds of Appeal	Recommendation	Appeal Score	Quantum Allocated	Yes - No																				
SUCCESSFUL APPLICANTS																																															
WCNA0001	: Ruter : Benjamin	RI	AE	Y	Y	Y	Y	0.0	30000	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	10366.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	91.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0002	: Arends : William	RI	AE	Y	Y	Y	Y	0.0	6570	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	41951.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	89.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0006	: Rooi : Petrus Andras	ADE	NM	Y	Y	Y	Y	0.0	15000	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	20485.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	89.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0007	: Barbary : Hendrik	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	100	20000	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	38306.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	89.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0007	: Van Wyk : Jakobus Petrus	NM		Y	Y	Y	Y	0	29241	0.0	0	2	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	18533.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	89.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0006	: Barbary : Victor Bennett	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	100	30000	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	12682.00	90	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	79.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0007	: Barbary : Marco James	ADE	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	30000	0.0	0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	22817.00	95	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	79.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0021	: Maslan : Jakobus	RI	JDW	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	10000	0.0	0.0	1	N	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	24843.00	95	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	74.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0044	: De Klerk : Elias	SJ		Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0.0	0.0	0	2	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	Y	29270.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0100	: Cloete : Dickson Stefanus	CC	ADE	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0.0	0.0	0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	18493	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0121	: Losper : Johnny Stanley	SJ		Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	22694	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0151	: Leggett : Jacqueline Susan	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	100	7240	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	F	Y	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	29937.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0128	: Cloete : Desmond Nicodemus	NM	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	23069.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0149	: Uys : Dean Anthony	SJ		Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	29046.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0057	: Vries : Jenner Matfry	NM	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	1	N	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	11208.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	49.0	YES	1000						
WCNA0142	: Jaar : William Henry	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	11	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	31265.00	90	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	45.0	YES	1000								
WCNA0054	: Fortuin : Brenden Fortuin	SJ	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	18845.00	96	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	44.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0072	: Ruter : Daniel	SJ	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	14576.00	98	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	44.0	YES	1000							
WCNA0003	: van Neel : Heinrich Glenville	ADE		Y	Y	Y	Y	0.0	0	0.0	0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	N	16324.00	98	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	44.0	YES	1000							
MATERIALY DEFECTIVE APPLICATIONS																																															
WCNA00110	: Magerman : Eric Martin	NM	RI	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	N	N	24499	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	No	NOT COMMISSIONED	Y	Applicant gave application form to Head of Correctional Services to commission but the commissioner failed to stamp the form correctly. The commissioner has now submitted a letter to confirm that it was his error in not commissioning the form correctly by not affixing the date stamp accordingly. Affidavit by appellant confirming that the information in the application form is correct.	Reasons submitted for application not commissioned to be accepted.	54	1000	Y
WCNA00125	: Vaughan : Arthur David	CC		Y	N	N	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	N	N	16693	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	No	NOT SIGNED OR COM	Y	According to the applicant, the Department urged the applicants not to use consultants and the applicant therefore completed his own application but failed to sign it. Affidavit provided by appellant stating that the appeal submitted on 30 January 2006 is true and correct and that due to ignorance he neglected to sign the application form. Is the sole breadwinner and is 100% reliant on WCRL.	Reasons submitted for application not commissioned to be accepted.	54	1000	Y
WCNA00906	: Cloete : Ella Maria	ADE	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	43003.08	0.0	0	2	Y	Y	F	N	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	0.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	52.0	No	NU, NPI	Y	Appellant has catching agreement with Oceana (Lambert's Bay Fishing Company) for use of the boat. However, the letter required from Oceana, in order for the applicant to receive her permit was always given late which inevitably left her with only two months in which to catch her allocation. She has thus under-caught by 36.9% over the past three seasons. The Appellant states that the women in this area do not go to sea as they have historically always worked in the processing factories. However, she confirms that her income is 100% derived from her WCRL right therefore she is willing to become fully involved. Applicant has included letters dated 25 January 2006, 19 January 2006, and 17 January 2006 from the Northern Cape MEC, Mr Sasiman, whereby he urges the Minister to make more allocations to the Hondeklop Baai non-successful applicants	Reasons for under utilisation accepted.	52	500	Y
WCNA00001	: Jantjies : Mary Charmagne	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100.0	6000	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	F	Y	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	19653.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	54.0	No	NPI	Y	Applicant was declared medically unfit at date of application and now submits letter from medical practitioner declaring the appellant medically fit. She has also submitted certificates of courses completed to enable her to go out to sea.	Applicant will not be personally involved.	54	0	N
WCNA00006	: Young : Andrew Baldwin	SJ		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100.0	20000	0.0	0	3	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	104372.00	19	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-90.0	-1.0	No	NR, LS	Y	Applicant was employed by VM Young to assist with their catch. Appellant attaches a letter stating that his employment was terminated on 31 December 2005 and therefore he will be 100% dependant on this right. Landing slips attached as proof of historical involvement and utilising his right. Applicant does not appear to be totally reliant on WCRL nearshore.	Reliance not sufficient to justify the allocation of a right. Reliance is measured in relation to medium term income only.	89	0	N
WCNA00031	: Van Den Heever : Reginald Alexander	RI		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	6000	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	5904.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	49.0	No	NPI	Y	Appellant has been declared medically unfit therefore is not able to be personally involved. However, he has invested much money and is 100% dependant on the resource that he states that he will personally go to sea, even though unfit, in order to retain his right.	Unlikely to be personally involved	49	0	N
WCNA00045	: Jathra : Hendrina Maria	NM	ADE	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	15000	0.0	0	3	Y	Y	F	N	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	56000.00	29	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-80.0	-28.0	No	NPI, NR, LS	Y	Appellant is an elderly lady who is medically unfit therefore is not able to be personally involved. Appellant feels that she should have been properly informed at registration that she would not be considered due to her non-involvement. She again submits doctor's letter confirming that she is not able to do physical work due to her arthritis. Appellant thought that if she applied as a female, she would stand a better chance of scoring higher than if she had let her son apply instead. She was not aware that she would score so low for not being personally involved. She is 71% reliant on a physical disability grant.	Applicant is unlikely to be personally involved.	-28	0	N
WCNA00052	: Isaacs : Katrina Elisabeth Cornelia	CC	SJ	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	3	Y	Y	F	Y	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	12000.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	19.0	No	NPI, LS	Y	Appellant states that she is an elderly lady therefore is not able to go to sea. Appellant assumed that she would obtain a high score due to being a female. She was unaware that she would score poorly due to not owning a vessel. She had to enter into a catching agreement, as her vessel was not suitable at date of application. She submits a letter regarding ownership of the vessel which she will be using by way of the catching agreement.	No proof submitted by appellant of any medical certificates to substantiate this. Applicant unlikely to be personally involved.	19	0	N
WCNA00152	: Raadt : Floors Johannes	NM	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	45000	0.0	0.0	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	0.0	N	Y	Y	N	9223.00	95	25.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-10.0	69.0	No	NU	Y	Appellant substantially under-caught in 2004/5 season due to applicant's engine not operating. Appellant decided it would be less expensive to asset another MTRH to catch in order to then utilise his engine for free, instead of hiring an engine. This led to him not having sufficient time and use of vessel to catch his own quota.	Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive.	69	0	N	

WEST COAST ROCK LOBSTER MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS - ZONE A

REFERENCE				IMPROPER LODGEMENTS	MATERIAL DEFECTS	ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT	PQR Risk	COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA																				DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN	REASONS	APPEAL																							
APP NO	APPELLANT NAME	AdCom 1	AdCom 2	Not Improperly Lodged	Signed Commissioned	No Other	Natural Person	SA Citizen	Access to Suitable	No PQR Risk	Percentage Share in Vessel	Value of Vessel Share	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Seasonal Jobs (7.5)	Processing & Marketing Records (7.6)	N	HDP	Gender	Black	CSi	Black Employees/Managers	Training	Crew member in WCRL in other Fishery	Crew Member in other Fishery	Entered into a Plea Bargain	Admission of Guilt	Annual Income	Percentage Income Generated through	Investment in Vessels	Jobs	Marketing/Processing	Historical Involvement	HDP	Gender	Black Employees	Training	CSi	Compliance	Reliance	TOTAL	DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN	REASONS	Appeal Submitted	Grounds of Appeal	Recommendation	Appeal Score	Quantum Allocated	Yes - No					
WCNA00163	: Klaaste : Leona Patricia	SJ	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	1	1	Y	Y	F	N	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	N	N	2000.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	17.0	No		Y	Appellant was member of Namaqua Marine CC. The CC under-caught by 41.6% over the 3-year period. Appellant is unsure of the reason for this as she was excluded from the running of the business. Applicant has worked as a packer for Premier fishing for many years. Her husband will be personally involved but they decided to apply for the right in her name instead.	No proof of involvement in sector during MTR period. Applicant unlikely to be personally involved.		17	0	N		
WCNA00161	: Cloete : Abraham Gideon	CC	ADE	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0	2	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	0.0	N	Y	N	N	N	40142.00	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	56.0	No		Y	Appellant's catch records indicate that he has not under-caught by more than 23.7% over the three-year period.	Applicant has under-utilised his medium term right measured against the 20% utilisation figure.		56	0	N					
ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURES																																																						
WCNA00015	: Beukes : Charmaine	NM		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	0.0	0.0	2	Y	Y	F	Y	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	N	3732.10	100	0.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	19.0	No			NPI, NU, LS									
WCNA00053	: Stuurman : Charlton James	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	50	10000	0.0	0	N	Y	M	N	N	0.0	N	N	N	N	N	N	62000.00	0	35.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	-100.0	-61.0	No												
WCNA00158	: Coortman : Andries Jakobus	ADE	RI	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	50000	0.0	1	1	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	0.0	N	N	N	N	N	24157.00	100	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	51.0	No													