

WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE B MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDER APPEAL DECISION SPREADSHEET

APP NO	APPELLANT NAME	IMPROPER LODGEMENTS	MATERIAL DEFECTS	ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURE										PQR Risk	COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA										COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES										DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN)	REASONS	APPEAL																			
				Not Improperly Lodged	Signed	Commissioned	Other	Natural Person SA Citizen	Access to Suitable Vessel	No impermissible multi sector involvement	Fully utilised MTR	No serious non-compliance	Not charged with an offence		More than four years resident	Personally involvement	SAMSAs Certificate	Percentage Share in Vessel	Value of Vessel Share	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Permanent Jobs (7.5)	Seasonal Jobs (7.6)	Processing & Marketing Records	HDP	Gender	CSI (7.3)	Black Employees (number of black employees)	Black Managers	Training (average number of the period)	Crew Member in WCRL Fishery (6.1)	Crew Member in other Fishery (6.3)	Entered into a Plea Bargain (6.1.2)	Admission of Guilt (3.1.3)	Annual Income				Percentage Income Generated through WCRL	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Investment in Vessels	Jobs	Marketing / Processing	Historical Involvement	HDP	Gender	Black Employees	Training	CSI	Compliance	Reliance	TOTAL	Appeal Submitted	Grounds of Appeal	Recommendation	Appeal Score	Quantum Allocated	Yes / No / Maybe
WCNB01203	: Cloete : Pieter	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	7000	35000.0	2	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	2	N	N	N	N	120000.00	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	57.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	57	0	N							
WCNB01204	: Barnabas : Maria	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	35000	N	2	Y	Y	F	Y	Y	3	Y	N	N	N	55353.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	95.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	95	0	N							
WCNB01211	: Van Rhyn : Aletta Katrina	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	10000	N	0	2	N	Y	F	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	70564.00	80	0.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	89.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	89	0	N						
WCNB01212	: Whittles : Japie	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	17784	Y	1	Y	Y	M	N	Y	1	Y	N	N	N	26865	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	96.0	YES	750	N													
WCNB01215	: Kapiera : Jakob Jakobus	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	12000	N	0	3	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	90000	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	91.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	91	0	N							
WCNB01217	: Cloete : George Charles	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	18000	N	0	4	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	4	Y	N	N	N	69276.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	92.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	92	0	N						
WCNB01219	: Gqoboka : Mzawudumi Julius	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	Y	Y	2	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	2	Y	N	N	N	Y	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750	N														
WCNB01220	: Johnson : Edmund Samuel Hendrik	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	10000	2150.0	0	2	Y	Y	M	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	65663.81	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	96.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	96	0	N						
WCNB01229	: Mento : Morrie	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	1000	N	0	2	Y	Y	M	N	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	YES	750	N													
WCNB01233	: Vollenhoven : Davids	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	N	N	2	2	N	Y	M	Y	Y	N	N	N	N	Y	0.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	46.0	NO		NR	Y	General - Various	Applicant has passed away. Policy does not allow allocation to estate. Cannot be personally involved.	46	0	N							
WCNB01239	: Julies : Petrus	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	20000	N	N	2	Y	Y	F	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	24200.00	50	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	-50.0	44.0	NO		LS	Y	Reliance	Indicates reliance is in fact 100%. Cannot be correct, because also works on vessel in WCRL offshore sector. Sufficient reliance demonstrated for reduced quantum allocation.	94	500	YR					
WCNB01241	: Koozen : Lyle Franklin	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	11172	Y	0	0	N	Y	M	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	0	100	5.0	35.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	44.0	NO		LS	Y	Did not show historical involvement, because only received transferred right one month before end of the season.	Appellant did not require right to show historical involvement. Could have been involved in capacity as crew member without a right. Involvement as crew member cannot be assumed.	44	0	N					
WCNB01254	: Van Der Heever : John Ashley	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	33040	Y	1	2	Y	M	Y	Y	1	Y	Y	N	N	73834.52	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	97	750	N							
WCNB01264	: Shoshola : Rosetta Marina	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	100	18000	N	0	2	Y	F	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	98.0	NO		NU	Y	Explains reasons for under catch. 2002/2003 : Boat owner did not act in accordance with agreement. 2003/2004 : Entire allocation landed. 2004/2005 : Engine and weather problems	Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive.	98	0	N							
WCNB01267	: Smith : Rudolf Francois	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	2	Y	M	Y	Y	2	Y	N	N	N	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	57.0	YES	750	N													
WCNB01287	: Angle : Andy Fran	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	35000	N	0	3	Y	M	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	17359.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	NO		NU	Y	Could not fully catch his 2003 quota since he had vessel problems. Appellant lost his equipment and his machinery gave in as well and financially he could not afford to go out and catch his quota.	Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive.	90	0	N						
WCNB01293	: Breakfast : Lucy Nosisi	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	0	2	Y	F	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	59.0	NO		NU	Y	Residing in Lamberts Bay since 1998 and is 100% reliant on WCRL and is the sole breadwinner. Landing slips provided. During the 2002/3 season the Appellant did not catch all her quota since the vessel owner with whom the Appellant had an agreement did not comply with the agreement and after the vessel broke down the vessel owner threatened the Appellant with legal action if she changed to another vessel. During the 2004/5 season the vessel owner had engine troubles again and threatened her with legal action. Currently the Appellant has a catching agreement and is in the process of getting her own vessel. Provided the catching agreement and SAMSAs certificate to the original application form.	Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive.	89	0	N						
WCNB01295	: Coetzee : Sarah	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	2	Y	F	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	58.0	YES	750	N													
WCNB01297	: Titus : Daniel	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	12000	N	0	2	Y	M	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	YES	750	N													
WCNB01303	: Mdaka : Sgxegele	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	4386	N	0	2	Y	M	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	29534.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	YES	750	N												
WCNB01316	: Poulse : Penelopie	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	N	Y	F	N	Y	N	N	N	N	0.00	0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		NPI	N												
WCNB01317	: Busakwe : Sydney	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	2	Y	M	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	48000.00	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	55.0	NO		NU	Y	Affidavit by Appellant stating that he caught his own quota with the help of someone else. Landing slips provided. Utility Bill for 2005 provided. Did not know that he was supposed to go for the SAMSAs courses. Catching agreement provided. Did not catch his full quota during the 2002/3 season due to vessel problems and the second permit was only issued on 1/7/2003. Local General Safety Certificate attached.	Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive.	95	0	N						
WCNB01318	: Nene : Lindelwa Cynthia	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	2	Y	F	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	58.0	YES	750	N													
WCNB01319	: Tola : Lumka Priscilla	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	0	N	Y	F	N	N	N	N	N	0	100	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		LS	Y	Subsistence permit attached as proof of historical involvement. Utility Bill for 2006 provided. Marketing and Processing agreement attached.	No landing slips provided. Not sufficient proof of involvement as crew/skipper during MTR period.	7	0	N							
WCNB01328	: Dampies : Wilfred James	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	25000	N	0	2	Y	M	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	46491.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	YES	750	N												
WCNB01342	: Cloete : Frank Nicolaas	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	40000	Y	0	3	Y	M	N	Y	Y	1.5	Y	N	N	N	141411.91	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	75	0	N							
WCNB01343	: Magerman : Daphne Joseline	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	0	N	Y	F	N	N	N	N	N	N	0	0.0																													

WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE B MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDER APPEAL DECISION SPREADSHEET

REFERENCE		IMPROPER LODGEMENTS	MATERIAL DEFECTS		ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURE										PQR Risk	COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA										COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES										DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN)	REASONS	APPEAL															
APP NO	APPELLANT NAME		Signed	Commissioned	Other	Natural Person SA Citizen	Access to Suitable Vessel	No impermissible multi sector involvement	Fully utilised MTR	No serious non-compliance	Not charged with an offence	More than four years resident	Personally involvement	SAMSA Certificate		Investment	Jobs	Transformation	Historical	Compliance	Reliance	Investment	Performance	Transformation Score	Compliance	Reliance	TOTAL	Appeal Submitted	Grounds of Appeal	Recommendation	Appeal Score	Quantum Allocated	Yes / No / Maybe																					
WCNB02166	: Heyns : Maria	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	0	0	N	5	2	Y	F	Y	Y	2	N	N	N	N	105122.79	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	20.0	NO		LS	Y	Historical involvement and investment	Confirms that was not involved on vessel as crew during MTR period. Indicated no investment made in initial application. Now claims 20% (R50 000) share in vessel. Not nominated vessel. Agreement undated, no proof.	20		0	N		
WCNB02199	: Visser : Daniel Erasmus	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	15500	Y	1	2	N	N	M	Y	Y	1	Y	Y	N	N	58643.00	70.0	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	-40.0	48.0	NO		LS	Y	Reliance	States that applicant will be 100% reliant. Was involved in offshore fishing as well. Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced quantum allocation.	58		500	YR	
WCNB02211	: Metu : Temba	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	45000	N	0	2	Y	M	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	7539	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	YES		750		N							
WCNB02212	: Heyns : Estelle Rachel	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N	5	Y	F	Y	Y	2.5	Y	N	N	N	90910	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	3.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	60.0	YES		750		N							
WCNB02213	: Jackson : Pieter Edward	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		N		N	Y	M	N	N		N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	NO			SV	Y	SV: Appellant provides proof of access to a suitable vessel.	Appellant was incorrectly marked as an essential requirement failure - demonstrated access to a suitable vessel in original application. However, Appellant is in fact a new entrant and does not show any historical involvement.	4			0	N
WCNB02226	: Taylor : Gert Johannes	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	15000	N	0	2	Y	M	Y	Y	1.5	Y	N	N	N			0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	92.0	NO		NU	Y	Appellant has provided an affidavit indicating that he did catch close to the entire allocation for all three seasons.	Departmental catch records indicate that the Appellant under caught by 100% in 2003, but the Appellant has provided signed bakkieslips for that period.	92		750	Y		
WCNB02228	: Zondeka : Buyisile Hasie	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	0	0	N		N	Y	M	N	N		N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		LS	Y	General - Reliance, historical involvement	Appellant is actually a new entrant. Has not provided proof of any historical involvement. No landing slips provided. No involvement as crew during MTR period.	4			0	N	
WCNB02229	: Diedericks : Johannes	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		N		0	2	Y	M	Y	Y		N	N	N	24586.00	100	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	16.0	NO		NU	Y	Appellant provides a municipal account in another name, and an affidavit saying that he has lived at that address for 25 years.	Appellant does not address score at all. Bakkieslips provided in the application form do not include the Appellant's name. No confirmatory letter included.	16			0	N	
WCNB02257	: Hermans : Magcinandile Sidwell	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	18000	N	0	3	Y	M	N	Y	2	Y	N	N	75000.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	91.0	YES		750		Y	QUANTUM	Refer to GPR for reasons on quantum allocation	91			0	N	
WCNB02286	: Mali : Thembelani Shephard	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		N		N	Y	M	N	N		N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		LS	Y	Access to vessel, reliance	Indicates that he will acquire a vessel upon allocation of a right. Policy does not allow for conditional vessel access arrangements. Does not address score. Does not address historical involvement in sector. No proof of being crew. No landing slips provided.	4			0	N		
WCNB03987	: Toontjies : Johanna	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	2600	N	0	0	N	Y	F	N	N		N	N	N	0.75	100	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		LS	N									