# WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE C MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS

**REFERENCE / IMPROPER LODGEMENTS / MATERIAL DEFECTS / ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURE / PQR Risk**

| APP NO | APPELLANT NAME | AdCom 1 | AdCom 2 | Not Improperly Lodged | Signed | Commissioned | Other | Natural Person | SA Citizen | Access to Suitable Vessel | No impermissible multi sector | Fully utilised MTR | No serious non-compliance | Not charged with an offence | More than four years resident | Personally Involvement | SAMSA Certificate | No PQR Risk |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00002 | : Greystone 393 CC - Thandile W Peter : | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00006 | : Erasmus : Johannes | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y |
| WCNC00007 | : Achilles : Samuel Jamie William | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00008 | : Blaauw : Audial | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00009 | : Van Hooi : Le-Anne Marrineze | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00010 | : Galant : Hester Celina | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00011 | : Smith : Naomi Maria | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00012 | : Faro : Catharina | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00014 | : Constable : Lizette | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00015 | : McQuire : Nolita Elizma | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00016 | : Blaauw : Winnifred Maria | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00017 | : Andrews : Elizabeth Johanna | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00018 | : Van Hooi : Hendrina | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00019 | : Engelbrecht : Sylvia Margaret | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00020 | : Constable : Deseree | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00028 | : Pieterson : Nicolas Johannes | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00030 | : Wilsnach : Eric Carl | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00053 | : Constant : Frank William | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00054 | : Ryk : Dawid | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00055 | : Smith : Bennie John | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00056 | : Prins : Jan | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00057 | : Laubscher : Jerome Ruben | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00062 | : Van Wyk : Lena | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00063 | : Bailey : Mavis | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00067 | : Coetzee : Dirk | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00068 | : Smeda : Aubrey | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00071 | : Siximba : Orsman | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00075 | : Clarke : Nigel Dean | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00078 | : Smith : Edward John | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00082 | : Kuilders : Christa | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00102 | : Duiker : Appolus Victor | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00104 | : Summers : Muriel Gertrude | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00106 | : September : Johanna | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y |
| WCNC00107 | : September : Dawid | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y |
| WCNC00109 | : Blaauw : Clifton | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00111 | : Segole : Isaac | CC | SJ | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00115 | : Macdonald : Martin James | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |

**COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA** (Investment, Jobs, Transformation, Historical Involvement, Compliance, Reliance) / **COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES** (Investment Score, Performance Score, Transformation Score, Compliance, Reliance)

| APP NO | Percentage Share in Vessel | Value of Vessel Share | Investment in Fishing Equipment | Permanent Jobs (7.5) | Seasonal Jobs (7.6) | Processing & Marketing Records | HDP | Gender | CSI (7.3) | Black Employees (number of black employees) | Training (average number of the period) | Crew Member in WCRL Fishery (6.1) | Crew Member in other Fishery (6.3) | Entered into a Plea Bargain (3.1.2) | Admission of Guilt (3.1.3) | Annual Income | Percentage Income Generated through WCRL | Investment in Fishing Equipment | Investment in Vessels | Jobs | Marketing / Processing | Historical Involvement | HDP | Gender | Black Employees | Training | CSI | Compliance | Reliance | TOTAL |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00002 | 10.0 | | N | 6 | 3 | N | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 46007.87 | 100 | 0.0 | 10.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | | 0.0 | 65.0 |
| WCNC00006 | 100 | 18000 | 24450.0 | | 3 | Y | Y | M | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | 3000.00 | 84 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | | 0.0 | 57.0 |
| WCNC00007 | 100 | 600 | 18040.0 | | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | 30348.00 | 80 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 56.0 |
| WCNC00008 | | 25000 | 858.0 | | 0 | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 28504.00 | 61 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -40.0 | 52.0 |
| WCNC00009 | 5 | 2500 | 323.0 | | 0 | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 82.0 |
| WCNC00010 | 5 | | 895.0 | | 0 | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 82.0 |
| WCNC00011 | 5 | | 858.0 | | 0 | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 77.0 |
| WCNC00012 | 4 | 2400 | 823.0 | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 88.0 |
| WCNC00014 | 5.0 | | 2080.0 | | 0 | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 10.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 67.0 |
| WCNC00015 | 4 | 2400 | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 0.0 | 25.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 83.0 |
| WCNC00016 | 5 | 2500 | 858.0 | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 88.0 |
| WCNC00017 | | 50000 | 886.0 | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.95 | 100 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 98.0 |
| WCNC00018 | 5 | 2500 | 828.0 | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 88.0 |
| WCNC00019 | 4 | 2400 | | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 4642.59 | 100 | 5.0 | 25.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 88.0 |
| WCNC00020 | | 45000 | | 0 | 2 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 15000.00 | 50 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -50.0 | 43.0 |
| WCNC00028 | | | Y | | 2 | N | Y | M | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | N | N | 2750.00 | | 5.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 56.0 |
| WCNC00030 | | 800 | 15500.0 | | | N | Y | M | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 19000.00 | 90 | 5.0 | 10.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 59.0 |
| WCNC00053 | | | | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | | 100.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 49.0 |
| WCNC00054 | | | | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | 100.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 9.0 |
| WCNC00055 | | | | 2 | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 9.0 |
| WCNC00056 | | | | 1 | 4 | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | Y | Y | N | N | | | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 89.0 |
| WCNC00057 | 100 | 15000 | 81490.0 | 0 | 1 | Y | N | M | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | 28773.05 | 58.29 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | -50.0 | 43.0 |
| WCNC00062 | | | | | | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | 11000.00 | 100 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 42.0 |
| WCNC00063 | 100 | 100 | | | | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 11000.00 | 100 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 87.0 |
| WCNC00067 | 100 | 85000 | Y | 0 | 1 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | 52000.00 | 100 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 96.0 |
| WCNC00068 | 100 | 3500 | N | 0 | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | N | Y | N | N | 26827.00 | 4 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -90.0 | 0.0 |
| WCNC00071 | | 0 | | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | 24000.00 | | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 9.0 |
| WCNC00075 | 100 | 19000 | | | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 81755.30 | 40 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -60.0 | 30.0 |
| WCNC00078 | 100 | 32000 | 9300.0 | | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 75000.00 | 50 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -50.0 | 45.0 |
| WCNC00082 | 100 | | | | | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | 11000.00 | 100 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 12.0 |
| WCNC00102 | 100 | 6100 | 3750.0 | 0 | 6 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | 121780.00 | | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -80.0 | -24.0 |
| WCNC00104 | | | | | | Y | Y | F | N | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 11000.00 | 100 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 52.0 |
| WCNC00106 | | | | | 0 | N | Y | F | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 7.0 |
| WCNC00107 | | | | 0 | 0 | N | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | | 0.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 39.0 |
| WCNC00109 | | 0 | | 0 | 1 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | | | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 55.0 |
| WCNC00111 | | | | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | Y | N | N | | | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 9.0 |
| WCNC00115 | 100 | 35000 | N | | 5 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | 12000.00 | 100 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 91.0 |

**DELEGATED AUTHORITY DECISION / QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN KGS) / REASONS / APPEAL**

| APP NO | DELEGATED AUTHORITY DECISION | QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN KGS) | REASONS | Appeal Submitted | Grounds of Appeal | Recommendation | Appeal Score | Quantum Allocated | Outcome |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00002 | NO | | ER | Y | Reason for refusal unclear, Appellant is Thandile W Peter not the CC. | Appellant was identified as Greystone CC in application. Clear that applicant did not intend to apply as CC. Thandile W. Peter signed application and provided all information. Landing slips provided and identify applicant. | 65 | 750 | Y |
| WCNC00006 | NO | | NU, NPI | Y | Bad weather and zone changes reason for non utilisation | Reasons provided for under-utilisation not persuasive. Appellant advances age as reasons for failure to be personally involved. Policy does not allow allocation to right holder who will not be personally involved in harvesting the resource. | 57 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00007 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00008 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00009 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00010 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00011 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00012 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00014 | NO | | NU | Y | Non-utilisation of MTR - vessel owner in breach of catching agreement . | Reasons for failure to utilise medium term right not persuasive. | 67 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00015 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00016 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00017 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00018 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00019 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00020 | NO | | LS | Y | General | Sufficient reliance demonstrated to qualify for reduced allocation of quantum. | 50 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00028 | NO | | NU | Y | ER failure - catch utilisation | Right was not allocated to the individual applicant during MTR period. Opportunity to catch was rotated. Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 56 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00030 | NO | | NU | Y | Catch utilisation | Catch records revisited. Landing slips considered. Right was sufficiently utilised. | 59 | 750 | Y |
| WCNC00053 | NO | | LS | Y | Vessel owner, employs black people, etc | Appellant has more than 50% ownership of vessel but was not scored for this (35); also employs black crew and was not scored (1); marketing and processing agreement provided but not scored (5); jobs not scored (5). New score places Appellant above cut-off. Appeal should be successful. | 95 | 750 | Y |
| WCNC00054 | NO | | | Y | Residence; employed 4 fishermen, investment in equipment, reliant on fishing for income | Proof of residence provided, safety certificate provided, no explanation for under-utilisation although some landing slips provided. | 9 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00055 | NO | | NU, NR | Y | Has invested in vessel, employed 3 black fishermen, CSI donations to local school | No proof of residence, under-utilisation due to illness, no proof of investment. Appellant has under utilised resource, but in any event does not score enough points to justify allocation of right. | 9 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00056 | YES | 750 | | Y | Quantum | Refer to GPR for reasons regarding quantum allocation. | 89 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00057 | NO | | NU | Y | Has utilised his right (landing slips indicate 200kg), should not be penalised for reliance. | Landing slips have been revisited. Clear that Appellant has in fact fully utilised right. Appellant sufficiently reliant. | 53 | 750 | Y |
| WCNC00062 | NO | | NU | Y | Appellant informed the Department that the reasons why she did not catch her full quota were: the consultant, the Klein Begin Association, instructed to collect the permits took off with their money; they then tried to have their quota transferred to Paternoster Visserye; then bad weather prohibited the catching of their quota. Catching agreement and affidavit by community leader confirming error made to question 2.14 of the Appellant's application and that it should be amended to "No". Landing slips attached as proof of historical involvement. | Reasons for under-utilisation accepted. | 82 | 250 | YR |
| WCNC00063 | NO | | NU | Y | Could not catch her full quota during 2004 since she had trouble with the consultant who collected her permit at the Department. Informed the Department that they received the permits late; bad weather conditions being another reason. | Reasons for under utilisation accepted. | 87 | 250 | YR |
| WCNC00067 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00068 | NO | | NU | Y | States that he has been involved in fishing for 31 years. Appellant wrote a letter to the Department on 4 July requesting her remaining quota of 200kg to be caught by Primordium in zone 8 but the Appellant never received a response from the Department. Letter from Primordium dated 31 January 2006 stating that they took out the Appellant's permit too late and also the weather did not permit him to catch his quota. Quotation for repair to a vessel attached. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 0 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00071 | NO | | LS | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00075 | NO | | NR | Y | Appellant states that he lives with his father in Paternoster and provides a Utility Bill in the name of his father and an affidavit. Is 40% reliant on WCRL for an income and the 420kg allocation is too little to make a living. | Residency accepted. Appellant however is not more than 50% reliant on WCRL for annual income. | 30 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00078 | NO | | NU | Y | Appellant states that on average he utilised 93.6% of his quota over the medium term period. Attaches SAMSA health certificate. States that he is reliant on WCRL for 80% of his income. | Landing slips have been revisited. Clear that Appellant has in fact suffiicently utilised right. Appellant sufficiently reliant to qualify for reduced allocation. | 50 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00082 | NO | | LS | Y | Had an allocation of 200kg which was caught by the Appellant herself. Catching agreement attached. Affidavit by Albertus Slingers stating that he made errors in completing questions 2.14 and 2.1. | No landing slips or letter from vessel owner. Historical involvement demonstrated through association through women's group. | 50 | 250 | YR |
| WCNC00102 | NO | | LS | Y | Appellant states that 7 quota holders joined their quotas together giving them a total of 2540kg. They worked in groups that went out to sea to catch the WCRL and thus there was no need to be personally involved all the time since the money was split up between the quota holders every week even if they didn't personally go out to sea. The Appellant also started working for Oceana in the Pelagic sector, but there might be a chance that he will lose his job since there are less pelagic fish along the West Coast. | No landing slips or letter from vessel owner indicating involvement as crew member during MTR period in WCRL nearshore sector. Lack of reliance. | -24 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00104 | NO | | NU, SV | Y | Appellant and other members of the Klein Begin Association had trouble in 2004 with the consultant that sent their permits to them late; they mentioned this to the Department and this is the reason why the right was not fully utilised. Letter addressed to the Department attached. Catching agreement with Paternoster Visserye attached. | Reasons for under utilisation accepted. | 52 | 250 | YR |
| WCNC00106 | NO | | NPI | Y | Appellant is the wife of a fisherman for 41 years and will not be personally involved but her husband will help her. | No landing slips - no historical involvement, and reliance not addressed. No personal involvement. | 7 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00107 | NO | | NPI | Y | Appellant is the owner of a vessel and will be personally involved. States that he has been a fisherman for more than 41 years. | No landing slips provided. No proof of involvement as crew/skipper in WCRL nearshore during MTR period. Reliance not addressed. No personal involvement. | 39 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00109 | YES | 750 | | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00111 | NO | | NC | Y | Affidavit stating residency and addressing the issue of the application form not being commissioned. | Appellant has access to a suitable vessel as per the original application. The reason for non commissioning to be accepted. Reliance and historical involvement not addressed. No proof of involvement as crew/skipper in WCRL nearshore during MTR period. No landing slips provided. | 9 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00115 | NO | | NU | Y | Could not catch his full quota during 2004 since his vessel broke down. He made a loan at Oceana to repair his vessel. Informed the Department of this and asked other vessels to catch his quota but they wanted to be paid cash on delivery while the Appellant only receives his money after a couple months in terms of the exporting contract. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 91 | 0 | N |

Delegated Authority: Dr A. Cockcroft ____________________

Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism: M Van Schalkwyk________________

30 May 2006

# WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE C MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS

| APP NO | APPELLANT NAME | AdCom 1 | AdCom 2 | Improper Lodgements: Not Improperly Lodged | Material Defects: Signed | Commissioned | Other | Essential Requirement Failure: Natural Person | SA Citizen | Access to Suitable Vessel | No impermissible multi sector | Fully utilised MTR | No serious non-compliance | Not charged with an offence | More than four years resident | Personally Involvement | SAMSA Certificate | PQR Risk: No PQR Risk |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00136 | : Peters : Wilson Shaun | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00137 | : Peters : Shaldon Christian | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00144 | : Longland : David Thomas | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00148 | : Julius : Lloyd Ross | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00149 | : April : Arviey Martin | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00170 | : Booysen : John | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00174 | : Galant : Ingrid | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00175 | : Julius : Sara | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00176 | : Julius : Maria Magdalena | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00177 | : Baron : Dina Johanna | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00178 | : Baron : Florendina Katrina | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00180 | : De Villiers : Beatrice Chathrine | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00181 | : Julius : Charmain | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00182 | : Louw : Sophia Magdalena | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00184 | : Ludick : Helena Mathilda | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00185 | : Williams : Jeona Veneathea | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00187 | : Adams : Mary Maria | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00188 | : Monk : Eva Helena | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00189 | : Thys : Sophia Elizabet | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00191 | : Wilschutt : Sandra Catherine | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00192 | : Claassen : Jeanette Jacoba | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00193 | : Wilson : Cynthia Maria | ADE | | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00194 | : Laubscher : Ellowese Melodene | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00195 | : Arendse : Francina | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00196 | : Julius : Inger | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00197 | : Stevens : Leah Sophia | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00198 | : Rosant : Francis Floriena | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00199 | : Coetzee : Mercia Beatrice | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00203 | : Afrika : Johannes Esau | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00207 | : Kwindla : Phathiwe Harriet | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00219 | : Snyders : Karools Baron | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00222 | : Charlies : Eva Florence | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00226 | : Jansen : Serene Anverita | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00227 | : Engelbrecht : Susanna Mathilda | CC | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00228 | : Davids : Edna Johanna | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00244 | : Bruintjies : Hendrick | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00268 | : Mafenuka : Siyabulela | NM | SJ | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00272 | : Kotze : Annesley Glenn | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00273 | : Schippers : Klaas | NM | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00274 | : Solomons : Sara | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| WCNC00282 | : Coraizin : Peter Jonathan | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00294 | : Gribble : Henry | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00295 | : Zacharias : Johannes Philip | RI | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00299 | : Brutus : Selma Cathrine | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00303 | : Karools : Willem | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |
| WCNC00308 | : Love : Cecil Raymond | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y |

**COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA**

| APP NO | Investment: Percentage Share in Vessel | Value of Vessel Share | Investment in Fishing Equipment | Jobs: Permanent Jobs (7.5) | Seasonal Jobs (7.6) | Processing & Marketing Records | Transformation: HDP | Gender | CSI (7.3) | Black Employees (number of black employees) | Training (average number of the period) | Historical Involvement: Crew Member in WCRL Fishery (6.1) | Crew Member in other Fishery (6.3) | Compliance: Entered into a Plea Bargain (3.1.2) | Admission of Guilt (3.1.3) | Reliance: Annual Income | Percentage Income Generated through WCRL |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00136 | 30 | 6000 | N | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | Y | N | N | 26000.00 | 0 |
| WCNC00137 | | 20000 | N | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | Y | Y | N | N | 24000.00 | 20 |
| WCNC00144 | | 100000 | N | 0 | 2 | Y | N | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 52000.00 | 50 |
| WCNC00148 | 75 | 11250 | 30780.0 | 1 | 2 | N | Y | M | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | 22000.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00149 | | 50000 | N | 0 | 5 | N | Y | M | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | 16000.00 | 0 |
| WCNC00170 | | 0 | N | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | |
| WCNC00174 | | 0 | N | | 3 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 19939.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00175 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 19939.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00176 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 2 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00177 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 2 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00178 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 2 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 16998.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00180 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00181 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 3 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00182 | | 1700 | N | | 4 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00184 | 4.4 | 1700 | N | | 4 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 16998.00 | 50 |
| WCNC00185 | 4.4 | 1700 | 525.0 | | 3 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 16900.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00187 | | 17000 | 5961.4 | | 4 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00188 | 4.4 | 1700 | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | | N | N | 19000.00 | 35 |
| WCNC00189 | | 1700 | | | 4 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | | N | N | 16998.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00191 | | 1700 | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 16998.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00192 | | 1700 | | | 4 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 16998.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00193 | | 1700 | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00194 | | 1700 | | | 4 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 27588.00 | 20 |
| WCNC00195 | 4.4 | 1700 | | | 2 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 17200.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00196 | 4.4 | 1700 | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00197 | 4.4 | 1700 | | | 2 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 18024.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00198 | | | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | | 100 |
| WCNC00199 | | | | | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 15000.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00203 | 100 | 15000 | | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | M | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 12000.00 | 80 |
| WCNC00207 | 15 | | | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | |
| WCNC00219 | | | | 11 | 11 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | Y | N | | N | N | | |
| WCNC00222 | | | | 0 | 2 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 0 | 100 |
| WCNC00226 | 100 | 12000 | | | | Y | Y | F | Y | N | N | Y | N | N | N | 21000.00 | 75 |
| WCNC00227 | | | | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 00 | 100 |
| WCNC00228 | | | | 0 | 2 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | N | N | N | N | | 100 |
| WCNC00244 | | 8000 | | 5 | 5 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | | |
| WCNC00268 | | | | 6 | | Y | Y | F | N | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | | |
| WCNC00272 | | 1500 | | 0 | 4 | N | Y | M | N | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | | |
| WCNC00273 | 100 | 30000 | | 1 | | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 30000 | 20000 |
| WCNC00274 | | 0 | | | 3 | | Y | F | N | | 3 | N | N | N | N | 50000.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00282 | | | | | | N | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | |
| WCNC00294 | 50 | 5000 | | 0 | 1 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 30000.00 | 25200.00 |
| WCNC00295 | | | | 0 | 4 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | | 100 |
| WCNC00299 | | 33600 | 10500.0 | 0 | 3 | Y | Y | F | N | Y | N | N | N | N | N | 33600.00 | 100 |
| WCNC00303 | | 5000 | 5000.0 | 0 | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 30000.00 | 84 |
| WCNC00308 | 50 | 5000 | | | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 70000.00 | 42.9 |

**COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES**

| APP NO | Investment Score: Investment in Fishing Equipment | Investment in Vessels | Performance Score: Jobs | Marketing / Processing | Historical Involvement | Transformation Score: HDP | Gender | Black Employees | Training | CSI | Compliance | Reliance | TOTAL | DELEGATED AUTHORITY DECISION | QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN KGS) | REASONS |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00136 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 44.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00137 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -80.0 | 4.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00144 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -50.0 | 36.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00148 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 51.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00149 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -90.0 | -39.0 | NO | | NR |
| WCNC00170 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 9.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00174 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 19.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00175 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 78.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00176 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00177 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00178 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00180 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 78.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00181 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00182 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 38.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00184 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | -50.0 | 29.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00185 | 5.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 84.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00187 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 98.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00188 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -70.0 | 8.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00189 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00191 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 39.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00192 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 78.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00193 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00194 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | -80.0 | -1.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00195 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 79.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00196 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 78.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00197 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 78.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00198 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 58.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00199 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 18.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00203 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 51.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00207 | 0.0 | 10.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 19.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00219 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 16.0 | NO | | SV |
| WCNC00222 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 58.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00226 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 89.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00227 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 18.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00228 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 18.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00244 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 91.0 | NO | | SV, NU |
| WCNC00268 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 19.0 | NO | | NC |
| WCNC00272 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 86.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00273 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 90.0 | YES | 750 | |
| WCNC00274 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 7.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 13.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00282 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | NO | | LS |
| WCNC00294 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 90.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00295 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 55.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00299 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 58.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00303 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 95.0 | NO | | NU |
| WCNC00308 | 0.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -60.0 | 30.0 | NO | | NU |

**APPEAL**

| APP NO | Appeal Submitted | Grounds of Appeal | Recommendation | Appeal Score | Quantum Allocated | Outcome |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| WCNC00136 | Y | Comparative balancing | No proof of involvement as crew/skipper in WCRL nearshore during MTR period. No landing slips provided. Denied involvement in WCRL nearshore in original application (Q.6.1). No proof of having been on vessel. Did not indicate sufficient reliance in original application. Does not claim any job creation. | 44 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00137 | Y | Reliance; involvement | Claims now to be entirely reliant on the resource - Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced allocation accepted. | 84 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00144 | Y | Investment; reliance; non-utilisation | Non-utilisation not sufficiently addressed. Reasons for non-utilisation not clear. Not reliant. | 36 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00148 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00149 | Y | Reliance; involvement | Claims now to be entirely reliant on the resource - Reliance sufficient taking into account status as MTRH. | 51 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00170 | Y | Vessel ownership; investment; job creation; processing & marketing records; historical involvement | Vessel ownership confirmed by SAMSA certificate. Job creation claimed. Black employees score added. | 50 | 750 | Y |
| WCNC00174 | Y | Historical involvement | Produced letter from MCM providing for representative to go to sea on behalf of right holder. Not historically involved. Could score available points for investment and other criteria in order to be placed above the cut-off, but not for historical involvement. Historical involvement will not be deemed on the basis of a letter. | 19 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00175 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00176 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00177 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 79 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00178 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 79 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00180 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00181 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00182 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 38 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00184 | Y | Reliance | Sufficient reliance demonstrated to qualify for reduced allocation of quantum. | 79 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00185 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00187 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 98 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00188 | Y | Non-utilisation due problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 8 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00189 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 79 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00191 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 39 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00192 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 78 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00193 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 79 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00194 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | -1 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00195 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 79 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00196 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 78 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00197 | N | | | | | |
| WCNC00198 | Y | Non-utilisation due to problems experienced with vessel owner and weather. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 58 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00199 | Y | Non-utilisation; historical involvement | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. No proof of involvement as crew during MTR period. | 18 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00203 | Y | Non-utilisation | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 51 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00207 | | General | No proof of involvement as crew/skipper in WCRL nearshore during MTR period. No landing slips provided. Denied involvement in WCRL nearshore in original application (Q.6.1). No proof of having been on vessel. No reliance claimed. | 19 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00219 | | | | | | |
| WCNC00222 | Y | Non-utilisation | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 58 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00226 | Y | Non-utilisation | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 89 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00227 | Y | Did not utilise right fully | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 18 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00228 | Y | Did not utilise right fully | No reason provided for non-utilisation other than that the first four years were difficult for applicant. Attaches two different SAMSA certificates and agreements for different vessels but does not explain why [same vessels as other applicants who have explained that vessel was damaged in bad weather]. Has purchased one of the vessels with other women. Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 18 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00244 | Y | Access, failure to utilise | Proof of change of ownership in vessel provided to substantiate that applicant is the new vessel owner. Vessel access accepted. Reasons for non-utilisation not persuasive. | 91 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00268 | | | | | | |
| WCNC00272 | | | | | | |
| WCNC00273 | | | | | | |
| WCNC00274 | Y | Historical involvement, marketing and processing records not attached, HDP status | Appellant already scored 7 points as PDI female. Marketing and process agreements attached in original application. No proof of involvement either by way of landing slips or anything else. In fact, appellant provides in main application that she is not personally involved since she takes care of her brother's son who is an epileptic. | 13 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00282 | Y | Investment, involvement and reliance | Appellant had not furnished much information in original application but has subsequently provided proof of agreements, vessel ownership and other investments, including employment of two seasonal workers. Material inconsistency between documents and version advanced on appeal and contained in original application form. Both versions cannot be correct. Material defect. | 4 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00294 | Y | Non-utilisation | Right could not be utilised fully due to the fact that the right was registered in Appellant's name, but three others benefited from the right as well; could not always fish due to weather conditions; landing site was far away and catches were poor by the time they got there; couldn't afford to cover petrol costs; lost one of their fishermen during that time; claims other MTR holders who didn't catch full quota were exempted by MCM and given a LTR. Attaches proof of training and investments made in fishing equipment. | 90 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00295 | Y | Non-utilisation | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 55 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00299 | Y | Attaches document re share in vessel; did not utilise right full quota because of problems that arose not due to her, but with the authorities in approving the number of the boat that she was supposed to use to catch her allocation. | Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. | 58 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00303 | Y | Non-utilisation: Appellant suggests that undercatch was due to the fact that the right was shared between 3 people, all of whom were responsible for catching; there were poor weather conditions; cost of catching was high coupled with low prices for crayfish; there was a traumatic incident with loss of life in the 2002/3 season. | Reasons for failure to fully utilise right not persuasive. | 95 | 0 | N |
| WCNC00308 | | | | | | |

Delegated Authority: Dr A. Cockcroft ____________________

Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism: M Van Schalkwyk________________

30 May 2006

## WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE C MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS

| REFERENCE | | | | IMPROPER LODGEMENTS | MATERIAL DEFECTS | | | ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURE | | | | | | | | | | PQR Risk | COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA: Investment | | | Jobs | | | Transformation | | | | | Historical Involvement | | Compliance | | Reliance | | COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES: Investment Score | | Performance Score | | | Transformation Score | | | | | Compliance | Reliance | | DELEGATED AUTHORITY DECISION | QUANTUM ALLOCATED (IN KGS) | REASONS | APPEAL | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| APP NO | APPELLANT NAME | AdCom 1 | AdCom 2 | Not Improperly Lodged | Signed | Commissioned | Other | Natural Person | SA Citizen | Access to Suitable Vessel | No impermissible multi sector | Fully utilised MTR | No serious non-compliance | Not charged with an offence | More than four years resident | Personally Involvement | SAMSA Certificate | No PQR Risk | Percentage Share in Vessel | Value of Vessel Share | Investment in Fishing Equipment | Permanent Jobs (7.5) | Seasonal Jobs (7.6) | Processing & Marketing Records | HDP | Gender | CSI (7.3) | Black Employees (number of black employees) | Training (average number of the period) | Crew Member in WCRL Fishery (6.1) | Crew Member in other Fishery (6.3) | Entered into a Plea Bargain (3.1.2) | Admission of Guilt (3.1.3) | Annual Income | Percentage Income Generated through WCRL | Investment in Fishing Equipment | Investment in Vessels | Jobs | Marketing / Processing | Historical Involvement | HDP | Gender | Black Employees | Training | CSI | Compliance | Reliance | TOTAL | | | | Appeal Submitted | Grounds of Appeal | Recommendation | Appeal Score | Quantum Allocated | Outcome |
| WCNC00311 | : Gronewald : Bernard Grehardus | ADE | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | 50 | 5000 | 5000.0 | | 2 | Y | Y | M | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 35000.00 | 38.3 | 5.0 | 35.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | -70.0 | 25.0 | NO | | LS | Y | Appellant provides information around non-utilisation. Reliance: Suggests that the possible income from WCRL was very little as the right was shared between 4 people. To survive the MTR period, he was forced to look for another source of income. | Appellant is only reliant on WCRL for 38% of his income. Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced allocation of quantum. | 95 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00358 | : Klaasen : Anna | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | 4.4 | 1700 | | 0 | 2 | Y | Y | F | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | 19000.00 | 40 | 0.0 | 20.0 | 5.0 | 5.0 | 40.0 | 4.0 | 3.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | 1.0 | 0.0 | -60.0 | 19.0 | NO | | LS | Y | Appellant states that she could not be reliant on a 200kg allocation, and needed to take on other work. | Appellant has demonstrated sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced quantum allocation. | 79 | 500 | YR |
| WCNC00377 | : Ndesi : Malixole | LB | SJ | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | | | | | | Y | Y | M | N | N | N | N | N | N | N | | | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 0.0 | 4.0 | NO | | LS | Y | General - reliance, historical involvement | Does not address score. | 4 | 0 | N |

Delegated Authority: Dr A. Cockcroft ____________________

Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism: M Van Schalkwyk_______________

30 May 2006