WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE E MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS DECISIONS

REFERENCE				IMPROPER LODGEMENTS	MATERIAL DEFECTS			ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURE										PQR Risk	COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA																		COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES													DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED	REASONS	APPEAL					
																			Investment			Jobs			Transformation						Historical		Compliance		Reliance		Investment		Performance			Transformation Score					Compliance	Reliance										
APP NO	APPELLANT NAME	AdCom 1	AdCom 2	Not Improperly Lodged	SIGNED	Commissioned	Other	Natural Person	SA Citizen	Access to Suitable Vessel	No impermissible multi sector	Fully utilised MTR	No serious non-compliance	Not charged with an offence	More than four years resident	Personal Involvement	SAMSA Certificate	No PQR Risk	Percentage Share in Vessel	Value of Vessel Share	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Permanent Jobs (7.5)	Seasonal Jobs (7.6)	Processing & Marketing Records	HDP	Gender	CSI (7.3)	Black Employees (number of black	Black Managers	Training (average number of the	Crew Member in WCRL Fishery (6.1)	Crew Member in other Fishery (6.3)	Entered into a Plea Bargain (3.1.2)	Admission of Guilt (3.1.3)	Annual Income	Percentage Income Generated through WCRL	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Investment in Vessels	Jobs	Marketing / Processing	Historical Involvement	HDP	Gender	Black Employees	Training	CSI	Compliance	Reliance	TOTAL				Appeal Submitted	Grounds of Appeal	Recommendation	Appeal Score	Quantum Allocated	Outcome
WCNE00071	: Davids : Johannes	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	10	10000	N		2	N	Y	M	N				N	N	N	N	20000.00	100	0.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	45.0	NO		LS	Y	Historical involvement	Was crew for WCRL, marketing and processing agreements provided. No processing and marketing records. Applicants not scored for processing and marketing agreements.	45	0	N
WCNE00072	: Lengisi : Dedi	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N		M		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	0.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Attached SAMSA Health Certificate and Charter Agreement dated 03/04/2006	Refuse appeal, score too low and vessel access agreement entered into after closing day for submission of applications.	0	0	N
WCNE00073	: Mqinyana : Melikhaya	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	M		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Attached SAMSA Health Certificate and Charter Agreement dated 03/04/2006	Refuse appeal, score too low and vessel access agreement entered into after closing day for submission of applications.	4	0	N
WCNE00074	: Ntuli : Mzomunye	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	M		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Attached SAMSA Health Certificate and Charter Agreement dated 03/04/2006	Refuse appeal, score too low and vessel access agreement entered into after closing day for submission of applications.	4	0	N
WCNE00075	: Kaite : Ntombizanelo Florence	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	F		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Attached SAMSA Health Certificate and Charter Agreement dated 03/04/2006	Refuse appeal, score too low and vessel access agreement entered into after closing day for submission of applications.	7	0	N
WCNE00104	: Watson : Claude Henry	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	100	200000	N	0	0	N	N	M	N	0			N	N	N	N	122048.0(	100	0.0	35.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	35.0	NO		LS	N					
WCNE00109	: Zuba : Nozuko	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	F		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Attached SAMSA Health Certificate and Charter Agreement dated 03/04/2006	Refuse appeal, score too low and vessel access agreement entered into after closing day for submission of applications.	7	0	N
WCNE00142	: Railoun : Fazlin	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	3	5000	N			Y	Y	F	Y				Y	N	N	N	66960.00	100	0.0	35.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	88.0	YES	750		N					
WCNE00152	: Arendse : Julian Peter	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	25	17000	Y	0	5	Y	Y	M	Y			4	Y	N	N	N	25200.00	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750		Y	Asks for 1.5 tons, which is viable	Refer to GPR for reasons for quantum allocation.	97	0	N
WCNE00161	: De Roock : John Ernest	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	200000	Y	4	4	Y	Y	M	Y			4	Y	Y	N	N	142425.0(	76	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750		Y	Quantum - reduced by 50%	Refer to GPR for reasons for quantum allocation.			
WCNE00164	: Roos : Richard William	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	3.12	5000	Y	0	5	Y	Y	M	N				Y	N	N	N	35000.00	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	95.0	RESERVED			N					
WCNE00171	: Herbert Anderson	SJ		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y			N				Y	M	N				N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	0.0	NO		LS	Y	General	Marketing and processing agreement provided, does not address score - no proof of historical involvement.	0	0	N
WCNE00188	: Rudolph : Deon Peter	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	17.0	9990.0	Y		Y	Y	Y	6		4	Y	N	N	N	18600.0(	30	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0		0.0	0.0	-70.0	-10.0	NO		LS	Y	Reliance	Submits that he has reinvested all proceeds back into the industry which reflects his commitment. Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced quantum allocation.	60	500	YR
WCNE00198	: Rudolph : Charles Shawn	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	16.75	10050	Y		6	Y	Y	M	N	6		4	Y	N	N	N	25000.00	51	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	-50.0	46.0	NO		LS	N					
WCNE00199	: Ndude : Mzondeni Mountain	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y			N			N	Y	M	N	0			N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		NPI	N					
WCNE00203	: Doty : Charles Ronald	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y			N			Y	Y	M	Y				N	N	N	N	29289.00	100	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	11.0	NO		NPI	Y	Personal involvement, historical involvement	Letter from skipper and bakkie slips confirming personal and historical involvement; will continue to be personally involved.	51	750	Y
WCNE00204	: Petersen : Ashleen Beatrice	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			N			Y	Y	F	N				N	N	N	N	14390.98		0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	12.0	NO		LS	Y	General	Landing slips and letters attached stating she was part of crew that harvested her own quota - indicated on application that she did not serve as ltd commercial or full commercial crew; indicated N/A under income generated from WCRL [answered unemployed] but harvested her quotas. Involvement accepted considering status as medium term right holder. Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced quantum allocation.	52	500	Y
WCNE00214	: Railoun : Shameem	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	3	5000	Y			Y	Y	M	Y				Y	N	N	N	66960.00	100	5.0	35.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	89.0	RESERVED			N					
WCNE00219	: Noor : Sayed Mogamad	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	3	5000	Y			Y	Y	M	Y				Y	N	N	N	66960.00	100	5.0	35.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	90.0	YES	750		Y	Quantum - indicates that 750kg will be insufficient to invest in the industry, and to provide jobs on a more sustainable level.	Refer to GPR for reasons for quantum allocation.	90	0	N
WCNE00225	: Titus : William Henry	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			N			N	Y	M	N	0			N	Y	N	N	70000.00	100	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV	Y	General - historical involvement, vessel	Appellant provides an unsigned catching agreement to use the vessel "Slingshot". No landing slips provided. Clearly involved in offshore sector. Letter and affidavit provided.	44	500	YR
WCNE00229	: Sikepe : Nqazimani Alfred	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			N			N	Y	M	N	0			Y	Y	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		NR	Y	NR - Provides a deed of transfer dated 2002 for property in Hout Bay. Provided catching agreement and correspondence with Mr Wolhuter (SACFC) requesting proof of employment, SAMSA medical certificate and training documents	Residence is accepted. Appellant is not a MTRH, cannot provide proof of historical involvement. No landing slips provided. No proof of involvement as crew during MTR period.	4	0	N
WCNE00246	: Davids : Mogamat Madnie	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	0	7	Y	Y	M	Y			1	Y	Y	N	N	35000.00	70	5.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	62.0	YES	750		Y	Quantum - indicates that 750kg will not be sufficient to invest in the industry.	Refer to GPR for reasons for quantum allocation.	62	0	N
WCNE00254	: Hendrikz : Sameul	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			N	0	0	N	Y	M	N	1			N	N	N	N	11300.00	54.86	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	-50.0	-45.0	NO		LS	Y	Appeal does not address Appellant's results, clearly prepared by consultants - refers to the Appellant as a new entrant, and does not consider MTRH scoring or criteria.	Catch records provided do not use Appellant's name, and no other information is provided that would prove involvement.	-45	0	N
WCNE00287	: Teichardt : Ivan Edward	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			Y	0	0	N	Y	M	Y	0			Y	N	N	N	84000.00	100	5.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	50.0	YES	750		Y	Quantum	Refer to GPR for reasons for quantum allocation.	50	0	N
WCNE00288	: Teichardt : Vanessa Henrietta	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			N	0	0	N	Y	F	N	0			N	N	N	N	2000.00	100	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		LS	N					
WCNE00289	: De Bruyn : Cynthia Cecilia	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y			N			N	Y	F	N	0			N	N	N	N	11620	21.5	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	-80.0	-73.0	NO		NPI	N					
WCNE00290	: Stanley : Zahida	CL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			N			N	Y	F	N	0			N	N	N	N	56522.00	3.5	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	-80.0	-73.0	NO		LS	N					
WCNE00294	: Roux : Gavin Louis	CL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	50000	Y	1	4	Y	N	M	N				Y	N	N	N	96843.46	50	5.0	35.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	-50.0	35.0	NO		LS	Y	Reliance	Accountant has provided letter specifying Appellant's reliance as 86.22% and 13.78% on linefish.	85	750	Y
WCNE00501	: Russel : Scott	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	100	65000	Y	2	5	Y		M	Y			1.5	Y	Y	N	Y	51000.00	56	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	-50.0	42.0	NO		LS	Y	Reliance	Submits that he will become even more reliant on WCRL now that his abalone quota has been reduced. Sufficient reliance demonstrated to qualify for reduced quantum allocation.	50	500	YR
WCNE00512	: Puwana : Zibangele Elliot	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	M		0			N	Y	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		NR	N					
WCNE00545	: Leibrandt : Alroy Dorian	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	3	5000	Y		6	N	Y	M	N	0			N	N	N	N	55000.00	100	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	50.0	YES	750		N					
WCNE00560	: Barron : Peter Daniel	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			N			Y	Y	M	N	0			N	N	N	N	18000.00	30	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	-70.0	-61.0	NO		LS	Y	Appellant has been involved for 40 years and is 100% reliant for an income. Letter from vessel owner confirming historical involvement.	No landing slips provided. Submits letter as proof of historical involvement. Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced quantum allocation.	50	500	YR
WCNE00562	: Sikinzi : Yoliswa	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			Y		F		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	0.0	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	8.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Appellant states that sometimes he does other casual work when the fishing factories does not have any work. SAMSA health certificate, copy of Jet MasterCard Credit Card letter, fishing vessel licence. Local General Safety certificate, catching agreement, processing and marketing agreement and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	18	0	N
WCNE00563	: Ntshiqa : Nomaza	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	F		0			N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	17	0	N
WCNE00564	: Mankayi : Ntombencinci Lueretla	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N		F		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	3.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	3.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	3	0	N
WCNE00568	: Danisa : Nogali Eunice	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	F		0			N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	7	0	N
WCNE00569	: Mfokazi : Tshonisile	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y			N			N	Y	F		0			N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR	Y	Temporary residence since his house burnt down. SAMSA medical certificate, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	4	0	N
WCNE00577	: Mahlangu : Musa	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			N			N	N	M	N	0			Y	Y	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	40.0	NO		SV, NR	N					
WCNE00580	: Joseph : Koesein	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			N			N	Y	M	N	0			N	Y	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		NR	Y	Letter from vessel owner/skipper confirming historical involvement as per the original application. States that he resides at the current address for the past 15 years. Had a 16,65% share in Fantastic Investments, but all assets including the gear and vessel was sold. Processing and marketing agreements attached to original application. Appellant had to be crew since he was a 16,65% shareholder of the CC and is 72% reliant on WCRL.	No landing slips provided. MTRH's were not scored for having concluded marketing and processing agreements but on their respective marketing and processing records. Letter confirming involvement in nearshore sector.	44	500	YR
WCNE00583	: Mantambo : Miriam Nosandile	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y			N			N	Y	F		0			N		N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		SV, NR, NPI	Y	Copy of letter from ABSA bank to Appellant, SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached. Cannot proof involvement since he only works on a casual basis for short periods.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	7	0	N
WCNE00591	: Menzana : Makwenkoke Isaac	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y			N			N		M		0			N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	0.0	NO		SV, NR, NPI	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements, tax invoice for re-licensing course and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached. Worked on a casual basis on vessels and therefore does not have proof of involvement.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	10	0	N
WCNE00592	: Hlatshwayo : Tatazela Selby	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y			N			N		M		0			N	N	N	N			0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	0.0	NO		SV, NR, NPI	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed. No marketing or processing records attached.	0	0	N

Delegated Authority: Dr A. Cockcroft ____________________

Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism : M. Van Schalkwyk ____________________

30 May 2006

WCRL (NEARSHORE) ZONE E MEDIUM TERM RIGHT HOLDERS DECISIONS

REFERENCE / IMPROPER LODGEMENTS / MATERIAL DEFECTS / ESSENTIAL REQUIREMENT FAILURE / PQR Risk

APP NO	APPELLANT NAME	AdCom 1	AdCom 2	Not Improperly Lodged	SIGNED	Commissioned	Other	Natural Person	SA Citizen	Access to Suitable Vessel	No impermissible multi sector	Fully utilised MTR	No serious non-compliance	Not charged with an offence	More than four years resident	Personal Involvement	SAMSA Certificate	No PQR Risk
WCNE00593	: Goniwe : Zukile Mathews	CL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y
WCNE00594	: Ndumndum : Mncedisi Richard	CC		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	Y
WCNE00596	: Hobongwana : Isaac	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
WCNE00597	: Ngwevela : Mziwandile Knox	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
WCNE00598	: Madinga : Benedictar Sindiswa	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
WCNE02425	: Andrew : Robert Grant	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02427	: Zilwa : Khayalethu	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02428	: Swart : Errol Peter	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02429	: Machosi : Elliot April	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02430	: Nkunzana : Spinach John	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02431	: Fortune : Moegamat Salie Fortune	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02435	: Adams : Dawood Karriem	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
WCNE02448	: De Roche : Ernest	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02449	: Edwards : James Stanley	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02450	: Baderoen : Nawawie	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02456	: Teichardt : Larry Clifford	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02458	: Edwards : John Kenneth	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02468	: Van Geems : Johann Morne	SM		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N
WCNE02487	: Vorsatz : Vernon	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02494	: Stefanus : Pasqualino Howard	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02507	: Tshikweni : Sambhaqa	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02520	: Geswindt : Christian Reginald	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02530	: Samaai : Nazeem	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02540	: Ball : Ronald	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02544	: Mhlongo : Bhekumuzi Ronald	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	Y
WCNE02547	: Albertyn : Ghoesyn	CC		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02574	: Keyser : Jaliel	JDW		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02575	: Davids : Mogamat Shamil	JR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02576	: Davids : Moegamat A'dnan	AL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02584	: Bosman : Daniel	CL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02585	: Fourie : Petrus De Bruyn	CL		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
WCNE02586	: Emandien : Moegamat Roesdien	CD		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
WCNE02590	: Hendricks : Yusuf	MR		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

COMPARATIVE BALANCING DATA (Investment / Jobs / Transformation / Historical / Compliance / Reliance)

APP NO	Percentage Share in Vessel	Value of Vessel Share	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Permanent Jobs (7.5)	Seasonal Jobs (7.6)	Processing & Marketing Records	HDP	Gender	CSI (7.3)	Black Employees (number of black	Black Managers	Training (average number of the	Crew Member in WCRL Fishery (6.1)	Crew Member in other Fishery (6.3)	Entered into a Plea Bargain (3.1.2)	Admission of Guilt (3.1.3)	Annual Income	Percentage Income Generated through WCRL
WCNE00593			N			N	Y	M		0			N		N	N		
WCNE00594			N			N	Y	M		0			N	N	N	N		
WCNE00596			N				Y	M	N	0			N	N	N	N		
WCNE00597			N				Y	M		0			N	N	N	N		
WCNE00598			N			N	Y	F	N	0			N	N	N	N		
WCNE02425	20	40000	Y		3	Y	N	M	Y			2.66	Y	Y	N	Y	136300.00	70
WCNE02427	20	40000	Y		3	Y	Y	M	N			2.66	Y	Y	N	N	29000.00	90
WCNE02428	20	40000	Y		3	Y	N	M	Y			2.66	Y	Y	N	N	75622.00	70
WCNE02429	20	40000	Y		3	Y	Y	M	N			2.66	Y	Y	N	N	10000.00	95
WCNE02430	20	40000	Y		3	Y	Y	M	N			2.66	Y	Y	N	N	27000.00	90
WCNE02431	50	40000	Y		4	N	Y	M	Y				Y	Y	N	N	62000.00	100
WCNE02435			N			Y	Y	M	N	0			Y		N	N		
WCNE02448	100	100000	Y	8	8	N	N	M	N	5		8	N	N	N	N	45000.00	
WCNE02449			Y			N	Y	M	Y				N	N	N	N	84.00	100
WCNE02450	60	96000	Y	2	4	Y	Y	M	Y			3	Y	Y	N	N	239393.41	71
WCNE02456			Y	0	0	N	Y	M	Y	0			Y	N	N	N	84000.00	100
WCNE02458			N			N	Y	M	N				N	N	N	N	61324.00	100
WCNE02468	55	60000	Y	1	4	N	N	M	N				Y	Y	N	N	140042.00	64
WCNE02487	16.65	9990	Y		6	Y	Y	M	N	6		4	Y	N	N	N	18600.00	30
WCNE02494	100	85000	Y		4	N	Y	M	N				Y	N	N	N	89352.00	100
WCNE02507			N			N	Y	M	N	0			Y	N	N	N	84000.00	100
WCNE02520			N			Y	Y	M	N				N		N	N	32000.00	100
WCNE02530			N			Y	Y	M	Y	0			Y	Y	N	N	84000.00	100
WCNE02540	40	36000	Y		4	Y	N	M	N			4	Y	Y	N	N	83162.00	70.86
WCNE02544			N			N	Y	M	Y	0			N	N	N	N		
WCNE02547	3.1	5000	Y		6	Y	Y	M	N				N	N	N	N	59520.00	100
WCNE02574	50	66223	Y	0	4	Y	Y	M	Y	6		2	Y	Y	N	N	32200.00	81.37
WCNE02575			N	0	7	Y	Y	M	N			1	Y	Y	N	N	11600.00	40
WCNE02576			N	0	7	Y	Y	M	Y			1	Y	Y	N	N	53000.00	74
WCNE02584	100	80000	N		8	Y		M	Y				N	N	N	N	60110	76
WCNE02585	50	40000	Y		4	N	N	M	N				N	N	N	N	45600.00	100
WCNE02586	100	75000	Y			Y	Y	M	N				Y	N	N	N	64280.00	63
WCNE02590	100	65000	Y			Y	Y	M	Y				Y	N	N	N	70000.00	64

COMPARATIVE BALANCING SCORES (Investment / Performance / Transformation Score / Compliance / Reliance) — DELEGATED AUTHORITY — QUANTUM ALLOCATED — REASONS

APP NO	Investment in Fishing Equipment	Investment in Vessels	Jobs	Marketing / Processing	Historical Involvement	HDP	Gender	Black Employees	Training	CSI	Compliance	Reliance	TOTAL	DELEGATED AUTHORITY	QUANTUM ALLOCATED	REASONS
WCNE00593	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR, NPI
WCNE00594	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR, NPI
WCNE00596	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR
WCNE00597	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		SV, NR
WCNE00598	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	7.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	7.0	NO		SV, NR
WCNE02425	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	93.0			
WCNE02427	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	0.0	96.0	YES	750	
WCNE02428	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	93.0			
WCNE02429	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	0.0	96.0	YES	750	
WCNE02430	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	0.0	96.0	YES	750	
WCNE02431	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	91.0	RESERVED		
WCNE02435	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	-80.0	-31.0	NO		LS
WCNE02448	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	-80.0	-33.0	NO		LS
WCNE02449	5.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	10.0	NO		NU
WCNE02450	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750	
WCNE02456	5.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	50.0	RESERVED		
WCNE02458	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		NU
WCNE02468	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	-40.0	46.0	NO		LS
WCNE02487	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	-70.0	26.0	NO		LS
WCNE02494	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	90.0	RESERVED		
WCNE02507	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	50.0	YES	750	
WCNE02520	0.0	0.0	0.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	9.0	NO		LS
WCNE02530	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	56.0	RESERVED		
WCNE02540	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0		0.0	0.0	91.0	YES	750	
WCNE02544	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	4.0	NO		NR
WCNE02547	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	54.0	RESERVED		
WCNE02574	5.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	97.0	YES	750	
WCNE02575	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0		0.0	-60.0	-4.0	NO		LS
WCNE02576	0.0	0.0	5.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	1.0	1.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	57.0	YES	750	
WCNE02584	0.0	35.0	5.0	5.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	0.0	47.0	NO		LS
WCNE02585	5.0	35.0	5.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0		0.0	0.0	46.0	NO		LS
WCNE02586	5.0	35.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		0.0	-40.0	49.0	NO		NU
WCNE02590	5.0	35.0	0.0	5.0	40.0	4.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	1.0	0.0	-40.0	50.0	YES	750	

APPEAL

APP NO	Appeal Submitted	Grounds of Appeal	Recommendation	Appeal Score	Quantum Allocated	Outcome
WCNE00593	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed. No marketing or processing records attached.	4	0	N
WCNE00594	N					
WCNE00596	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	4	0	N
WCNE00597	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed.	4	0	N
WCNE00598	Y	SAMSA health certificate, affidavit stating residency, fishing vessel licence, Local General Safety Certificate, Catching agreement, processing and marketing agreements and letter from vessel owner stating personal involvement attached.	Access to a suitable vessel to be accepted. No landing slips - no historical involvement and reliance not addressed. No marketing or processing records attached.	7	0	N
WCNE02425	Y	Quantum	Refer to reasons in GPR concerning quantum allocation.		0	N
WCNE02427	N					
WCNE02428	Y	Quantum	Refer to reasons in GPR concerning quantum allocation.	93	0	N
WCNE02429	Y	Quantum	Refer to reasons in GPR concerning quantum allocation.	96	0	N
WCNE02430	N					
WCNE02431	N					
WCNE02435	N					
WCNE02448	N					
WCNE02449	Y	Non-utilisation; Comparative balancing	Failed to fully utilise due to problems with the boat owner who was contracted to harvest the right. No details provided in this regard. Refers to bad weather as well. Applied for extension, but was refused. Relies on same reasons. No detail offered as to "difficulties experienced" with boat owner. Reasons were fully considered by Department and decision made. No new facts. Reasons again considered on appeal. Not persuasive. Comparative Balancing: No landing slips provided. Did not obtain slips for purposes of appeal. No proof of involvement. Processing and marketing records now provided and accepted. Exemption application included. Not considered. Appeals only currently under consideration.	10	0	N
WCNE02450	Y	Quantum	Refer to reasons in GPR concerning quantum allocation.	97	0	N
WCNE02456	Y	QUANTUM	Refer to reasons in GPR concerning quantum allocation.	50	0	N
WCNE02458	Y	Non-utilisation; Comparative balancing	Provides no reasons on appeal concerning under-catch. Relies on application for extension, which was previously refused by the Department. No new facts introduced. Reasons advanced not persuasive. Exemption application included. Not considered. Only appeals currently under consideration. Comparative balancing: landing slips provided and identify Appellant. Incorrectly completed Q.6.1. Should read "yes". Marketing and processing records included and now scored. Claims should be awarded for "other investment". Claims processing costs under this criteria. This does not represent scorable investment. Essential requirement failure not cured on appeal and comparative balancing score remains below the cut-off.	49	0	N
WCNE02468	Y	Marketing and Processing Agreement	Letter from S & W Fishing to confirm that the Appellant has partaken in marketing and processing. He should receive the points.	51	750	Y
WCNE02487	Y	Reliance	Appellant argues that he held his quota in a CC with 6 other members, and it was not possible to be fully reliant on WCRL (Nearshore). He has made significant investment into the industry. Sufficient reliance to qualify for reduced quantum allocation.	26	500	YR
WCNE02494	N					
WCNE02507	N					
WCNE02520	Y	General	Letter confirming that he created jobs for HDP's and worked on the vessel during MT WCRL period - no landing slips provided.	54	500	YR
WCNE02530	N					
WCNE02540	Y	Quantum	Refer to reasons in GPR for quantum allocation.	91	0	N
WCNE02544	Y	General - residency	Residency accepted. Score not specifically addressed. No proof of involvement in WCRL nearshore sector during MTR period. No landing slips attached.	4	0	N
WCNE02547	N					
WCNE02574	Y	Quantum	Refer to reasons in GPR concerning quantum allocation.	97	0	N
WCNE02575	Y	Reliance	Started fishing late in seasons due to delay in right transfer. Only received statement concerning income generated from WCRL after submission of application. Reliance figure therefore changed substantially. Reliance in fact at 91%. New reliance figure accepted.	56	750	Y
WCNE02576	Y	States that 750 kg not enough as he did not get handline on the Kareema-D	Refer to reasons in GPR for 750 kg allocations.	57	0	N
WCNE02584	Y	Investment of R 100 000.00 in vessel and R 130 000 in bakkie, skipper licence and list of crew, sole owner of vessel.	Appellant is 85 years old and claimed no involvement as crew in any fishing sector.	47	0	N
WCNE02585	Y	50% share in vessel, claimed no form of involvement as crew in original application .	Appellant is 62 years old and has claimed no involvement as crew in any fishing sector.	46	0	N
WCNE02586	Y	Invested R 75 000 in vessel. Wishes to apply for exemption from ER failure. Applied for extension of season in 2005 as he experienced difficulties with boat owner, then bought his own vessel. After vessel was approved, he had two days to fish. Also feels he should score 5 points for jobs. Feels he shouldn't be penalised for relying on squid as it is not income "outside the fishing industry".	Reconsider catch records in light of explanation given. Reasons for under utilisation not persuasive. Appellant did not claim any jobs in original application and cannot be rewarded for this on appeal. Penalty for non-reliance to be carefully reconsidered. Appellant is a mate on a squid vessel .	49	0	N
WCNE02590	N					

Delegated Authority: Dr A. Cockcroft ____________________

Minister of Environmental Affairs and Tourism : M. Van Schalkwyk ____________________

30 May 2006