Rhino horn trade and CITES: an overview from TRAFFIC

Dr Jo Shaw
Programme Officer – Large Mammal Trade
TRAFFIC East/Southern Africa
Who are TRAFFIC?

International non-governmental organisation who monitor the worldwide trade in wildlife goods.
DEA, SANParks, Provincial conservation agencies, Namibia, Swaziland, Zimbabwe, Private land owners, WRSA, specialists, plans for Botswana, Malawi, Zambia & Tanzania

African rhino range state reps, RMG chair, TRAFFIC, specialists, RESG/Interpol, private land owners donors

Rhino & Elephant Security Group/Interpol Environmental Crime Working Group

National conservation authorities, DEA, Private landowners
TRADITIONAL CHINESE MEDICINE

Rhino horn properties:
• reducing “hot blood”
• balancing body temperature
• eliminating toxins
• reducing fever
TRADITIONAL CHINESE MEDICINE

Rhino horn properties:

• reducing “hot blood”
• balancing body temperature
• eliminating toxins
• reducing fever
Rhino Horn Trade: Changing End Use Markets

1970-1990s

Japan
Korea
Taiwan
China

African Rhino range States

Yemen

Traffic: the wildlife trade monitoring network
Rhino Horn Trade: Changing End Use Markets

2005 to present

Now

Viet Nam
China
Thailand?

African Rhino range States
NEW USES AND MARKETS FOR RHINO HORN IN VIET NAM

1. A rejuvenating, **detoxifying tonic** for restoring general health following binging - ‘face consumption’ “Ferrari Factor”

2. High-value, **status-conferring gift or bribe**

3. Home preparation of medicines to **treat high fever**, especially in children

4. Alleged cure for **serious, often life-threatening diseases** such as cancer due to sensational ‘urban myths’
WHY VIET NAM?

Assessment ten years ago (Esmond Bradley Martin) found no evidence of rhino horn use;

- Rapid economic growth
- Increased disposable income
- Increasing ill-health (higher cancer rates)?
- “Face” culture
Chuyên bán địa mài sủng tê giắc

Địa mài sủng tê giắc cao cấp

CÔNG TY GỐM SỨ MỸ NGHỆ THIÊN DỨC
DC: Số 3 xóm 6 Giang Cáo - Bát Tràng - Gia Lâm - Hà Nội
ĐT: 04.38740101 - 04.38744767 - Fax: 04.38743460
E-mail: info@thienduc-ce.com

TRAFFIC
the wildlife trade monitoring network
PROS:

“Huge demand clearly exists for the product - legal supply may be more effective than prohibition”

“Reduce black market prices, thus reduce the financial gains made from illegal trade and hence reduce the number of rhinos poached”

“Sourced from rhinos that did not have to be killed for this purpose such as stockpiles / natural mortalities / legal dehorning activities”
PROS:

“Generate income to enhance security for existing rhino populations (*in-situ* across both Africa and Asia)”

“Positive incentives for on-going growth in rhino numbers and range”

“Reduction of rhino range is identified as a serious conservation threat above and beyond the current poaching crisis”
CONS:

“Demand from new non-traditional markets, may be greater than long-term supply from legal sources”

“Legal supply may legitimise or encourage rhino horn use and increase demand and current problems”

“Demand reduction campaigns and substitution have worked in former major markets in the past (e.g. Japan)”
CONS:

“Legal supply to treat fatal illnesses, is ethically wrong in the absence of clinical trials and scientific evidence of efficacy”

“Some farmers may selectively breed rhinos for large horns, potentially resulting in a genetic skew”

“Trade or sustainable utilisation of wildlife is inherently wrong and should never be countenanced”
Practical considerations

Who will be selling?
What will they sell?
When and what time-frame?
How much can they put on the market?
How will that market work?
How will the price be determined?
To whom will they sell?
Where will the money go?
How would a legal supply be identified, controlled, audited and monitored?

International trade in Endangered Species is regulated by CITES
WHAT IS CITES?

CITES is the Convention on International Trade in Endangered Species of Wild Flora and Fauna

A binding international agreement between countries established in 1975.

Aim is to ensure that international trade in wild animals and plants does not threaten their survival.
CITES Listings

Appendix I includes species threatened with extinction. Trade in specimens of these species is permitted only in exceptional circumstances.

All **Asian** rhinos (Indian, Sumatran and Javan)

**Black** rhinos *(exception for hunting quota of five males a year in South Africa and Namibia approved at CoP13 in 2004)*
Southern **white rhino**

Appendix I

**and II** (only the population of South Africa and Swaziland and “*for the exclusive purpose of allowing international trade in live animals to appropriate and acceptable destinations and hunting trophies*” - CoP9 1994 and CoP13 2004)
How CITES works?

- Proposal justifying a change in the current listing
- Listings have specific biological and trade criteria which must be met
- Any proposal would have to come from the National government of a member state
- Can only be considered at the Conference of the Parties (CoP)
- 175 CITES parties would vote on whether to accept the proposed change
- Two-thirds majority support required for a change to be accepted
CITES CoP16 DEADLINES

3rd - 15th March 2013 16th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties to CITES, Thailand

7th April 2012 Deadline For Submissions To CoP16 Without Consultation

4th October 2012 Deadline For Submissions To CoP16

March 2016 17th Meeting of the Conference of the Parties to CITES
CONVINCING SUBMISSION

• Trading partner (trade is a partnership between market and source)
• Convincing regulation right along trade chain
• Clear differentiation between legal and illegal horn
• Verifiable rhino population and hornstock information and monitoring scheme
• Convincing reason why this would benefit long-term global rhino conservation

• Panel of expert process: to verify information provided in source country and trade partner
• Appears to be leading destination / consumer
• Domestic trade in rhino horn is currently illegal
• Many arrests for illegal trade / “pseudo-hunting” of Vietnamese in South Africa
• No seizures of illegal rhino horn since 2008
• South Africa has exported 657 trophy horns to Viet Nam since 2003
• Clearly not regulating current trophy imports
Javan Rhino extinct in Viet Nam

Hanoi, Viet Nam, 25th October 2011—The last Javan Rhinoceros in Viet Nam was shot and its horn removed, presumably by poachers, according to a new WWF report.

“It’s hardly surprising the horn was missing from the last rhino as Viet Nam is the pre-eminent market destination for illegally sourced rhino horns,” said Tom Milliken, TRAFFIC’s rhino expert.

The Javan Rhino was confirmed extinct in the country after genetic tests confirmed that all 22 rhino dung samples collected between 2009—2010 in Cat Tien National Park in southern Viet Nam originated from a single animal.

It was the individual found dead with a bullet in its leg and its horn removed in April 2010.

“It’s tragic that the Javan Rhino has been wiped out in Viet Nam by the same forces that are driving rhino poaching in Africa,” said Milliken.
RECOMMENDATIONS

- Address capacity constraints affecting conservation authorities
- A secure, national, electronic integrated database and permit system
- National database and DNA sampling of all rhino horn stocks with auditing and monitoring
- Tighten law enforcement at all ports of entry and exit
- Profiling to identify likely suspects
RECOMMENDATIONS

• Bi-lateral treaties to promote collaborative law enforcement action (Mozambique / Viet Nam)
• Detailed analysis of all relevant crime dockets - intelligence gathering and investigations
• Specific prosecutors for rhino crime cases in each province
• Translators (specifically Vietnamese) to help investigations and court cases
RECOMMENDATIONS

• Monitoring and regulation of sport hunting of white rhino
• Better regulation of wildlife veterinarians and professional hunters
• Legal investigation into the denial of permits for those charged with wildlife crimes
• Objectively evaluate all options based on pros and cons in terms of how likely they are to meet global rhino conservation objectives
The South Africa – Viet Nam Rhino Horn Trade Dynamic:

Launch July 2012

THANK YOU
joannes@ewt.org.za