

THE SECOND NATIONAL DIALOGUE WORKSHOP ON THE INTENSIVE AND SELECTIVE BREEDING OF COLOR VARIANTS

2 December 2015

Terms of Reference & Recap of the 1st
National Dialogue Workshop (Durban)

Presentation Overview

Terms of Reference for the National Dialogue Workshops on color variants

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban)

The Programme of this 2nd National Dialogue Workshop (Pretoria)

Next steps - what will happen after this 2nd National Dialogue Workshop



KAYANN
CONSULTING

Terms of Reference : Aims & Objectives

Project aims are to understand :

- To better understand the the practice of selective and intensive breeding of color variants,
- Enable the Scientific Authority, in conjunction with DEA, to decide on and agree to a threshold to initiate stricter regulation.

Specific objectives of the assignment are :

- To facilitate dialogue between different role players and stakeholders involved in selective breeding of colour variants,
- To identify the key issues and challenges related to selective breeding of colour variants,
- To make recommendations for selective and intensive breeding of colour variants, in partnership with stakeholders.

Terms of Reference : Key Tasks

Key Tasks include:

- Facilitation of a workshop to held in Durban on the 6th November 2015
- Facilitation of a workshop to be held in Pretoria 2nd December 2015
- Compilation of the key issues/challenges identified at these workshops and delivery of a final report
- Provide recommendations on the way forward

Terms of Reference : Deliverables

Facilitate a process of a national dialogue through a series of workshops relating to the intensive and selective breeding of color variants

Facilitate and manage discussions between various stakeholders at two workshops

**Compile a report reflecting the key issues emanating from each of the respective workshops (i.e. two reports),
Provide recommendations on the way forward for the sector based on the findings and discussions at the workshops,
Compile a report for dissemination to the industry.**

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban):

- ✓ The first National Dialogue Workshop on Color Variants took place on the 6th November 2015
- ✓ The Workshop was convened as the core element of the Wildlife Sector Session of Biodiversity Economy Indaba which took place on 5th to 7th November 2015
- ✓ As per attendance register some 56 people participated in the 1st National Dialogue Workshop discussion and represented stakeholders as follows:
 - National government departments (e.g. DEA, DRDLR) – 32%
 - Provincial government departments (e.g. LEDET, GDARD) – 7.1%
 - Conservation agencies (e.g. KZN Wildlife, SANPARKS) – 16%
 - Wildlife industry (e.g. game ranching, hunting, translocation) – 14.3%
 - NGOs, communities, other private sector & other – 48%



NB : % are in terms of individuals and not organisations

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban)

- ✓ The Programme of the 1st National Dialogues Workshop was structured as follows :
- ✓ **Opening and introductory remarks** by DEA (Dr Moscow Marumo, Chief Director)
- ✓ **Strategic elements** of wildlife sector : transformation and socio economic development perspective
 - The transformation of the wildlife economy (Mr Ngcali Nontshongwana, DEA)
 - The role of national parks in community development (Ms Wanda Mkhutshulwa, ME : Socio Economic Development, SANPARKS)
 - Community participation in conservation : a people and parks programme (Ms Koena Cholo, DEA)
 - Transformation of game ranching : a black game rancher's perspective (Mr. Mike Gcabo, WRSA)
 - A perspective of a new entrant in the game ranching industry (Mr. Tebogo Mogashoa, WRSA)
- ✓ **Issue presentations** on selective and intensive breeding of color variants
 - Coat color variants : fact or fiction ? (Dr Pieter Oberem, WRSA)
 - Intensive breeding and genetics (Dr Desiree Dalton, National Zoological Gardens)
 - Selective breeding: in practise and lessons learnt (Mr Barry York, WRSA)
 - Color variation: in practise and lessons learnt (Mr Richard York, WRSA)
 - Impact of color variants on professional hunting (Mr Herman Meyeridicks, Professional Hunting Association)
- ✓ **Panel discussion**: WRSA speakers, Professional Hunting Association plus a representative from CHASA

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban): key points made (issue presentations)

Genetics, conservation, sustainable use

- ✓ Variations / mutations which tend to be in limited numbers or rare within species are normal part of nature and are normal part of the gene pool of species.
- ✓ Variations/ mutations are the basis for evolutionary diversity
- ✓ Color variation is as a result of natural/ selection pressures
- ✓ Underlying scientific reasons for color variations are not that clear
- ✓ Evolution is dynamic and changes in the environment drive selection of certain traits
- ✓ There are many examples color variation in several species in nature.
- ✓ “Emotional terminology” (e.g. abnormal, abhorants) should not be used in describing variants and myths should be dismissed. Controversies of genetic manipulation are “uninformed”.
- ✓ Artificial selection can fixate mutations and increase their numbers
- ✓ Artificial breeding of a small genetic pool may lead to the risk of inbreeding (siblings/ line breeding)
- ✓ Inbreeding can lead to reduction in genetic fitness, limitations in populations adapting, vulnerability to parasites/ pathogens, limited ability to adapt to changing habitats and lower reproduction rates

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban): key points made (issue presentations)

Genetics, conservation, sustainable use

- ✓ There is a need to distinguish between conservation vs. preservation as philosophies.
- ✓ Context that this about natural resources management is important. Do we manage or leave it to nature. We should be careful about terminology e.g. what is a natural area ?
- ✓ Wildlife ranches contribute to conservation and biodiversity (e.g. 50% of the rhinos are in private land)
- ✓ There is unfair criticism of ranches for breeding species that are seen as not same as in the wild
- ✓ Accusation that there is artificial creation of color are unfounded
- ✓ Color variants are in less than 5% of game ranches and make up less than 1% of the animals in these ranches. Risk of escape into the wild is minimal.
- ✓ Breeding practice balances efficiency and profitability and considers traits such as fertility, colour etc. Color variants shift the bell curve in a positive direction as you select stronger animals.
- ✓ Breeding practice used in game farms adopts semi extensive farming which mimicks the natural system
- ✓ “Do not believe in inbreeding”

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban): key points made (issue presentations)

Economics, poverty, socio economic development

- ✓ Focus of the wildlife sector needs to consider all markets including: hunting, wildlife ranching, meat and tourism
- ✓ Economics and attaching value to wildlife has had a positive effect on the increased numbers of animals (example of East Africa where policies on trade and sustainable use have been restrictive has led population of game decreasing there).
- ✓ Premium value of color variants is due to these being rare.
- ✓ Poverty is the greatest threat to biodiversity and is the cause for poaching.
- ✓ Game ranching provides socio economic benefits to rural people that is greater than other land use options
- ✓ Breeding color variants provide short term high returns and are means for providing cashflow particularly for new entrants
- ✓ Objective of game ranching is wealth creation and secondly it contributes to conservation
- ✓ Sustainable farming allows for sustainable use that benefits people
- ✓ In hunting industry the demand for colour variants has not observed

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban): key points made (issue presentations)

Economics, poverty, socio economic development

- ✓ European hunting market for example has preference for hunting of wild animals
- ✓ Question of demand needs to be analysed

Regulation

- ✓ NEMBA/ CBD provides for conservation of genetic diversity (color variation being a form of)
- ✓ WRSA code of conduct not sufficient, DEA needs to come in to ensure self regulation by industry has teeth
- ✓ Is DEA the right regulator ? Or is DAFF not the right regulator ?
- ✓ Government sustainable use policy needs improvement

Reputational issues

- ✓ Attention should be paid to ethical practices in the industry
- ✓ Irresponsible breeding poses reputation risks

Recap and summary of the 1st National Dialogue Workshop (Durban): emerging recommendations

- ✓ Participatory dialogue incorporating civil society, scientists and other stakeholders required
- ✓ Establish internal working group which should have been established before this issue being made a public issue
- ✓ Establish agreement on terminology and use of the terminology
- ✓ Scientific assessment to establish the status and the extent of the color variants as an issue should be undertaken. What is the actual problem statement ?
- ✓ Scientific Authority is embarking on process of investigating the issue of color variants further. Key questions to be investigated need to be determined ?

The Programme of this 2nd National Dialogue Workshop (Pretoria)

- ✓ Continue the dialogue and add further perspectives from in particular scientists, hunting industry, conservation authorities, NGO/ civil society
- ✓ Agenda covers:
 - Biodiversity and conservation perspectives and some policy statements
 - Unpack further key issues often referred to, some of the concerns and potential risks (e.g. genetic risks, ecosystem & landscape risks, economic perspective, reputational and regulatory issues)
 - Further input from the wildlife industry
 - Small group breakaway (to receive inputs on what participants perceive to be key issues having listened to the speakers as well as make proposals on way forward)
 - Panel (if time permits) for the speakers to respond to issues and recommendations emanating from small groups to determine areas of agreement and areas of disagreement
 - Biodiversity and conservation context and some policy statements

Next steps : what will happen after this workshop

- ✓ There will be workshop reports (2x) for DEA
- ✓ A National Dialogue Report that provide recommendations on the way forward for the sector based on the findings and discussions at the workshops will be drafted
- ✓ Executive Summary (with recommendations, key findings and summary of discussion) will be circulated for comment to participants (to take place on about **18 December 2015** to 22 January 2016)
- ✓ Comments will the incorporated and will be used to update the final National Dialogue Report which will be submitted to the DEA and the Minister for her actioning
- ✓ Project close is on about **14 January** to 31st January 2015

NB: timelines are being revised to consider the December holidays

Thank you
Kea leboga
Ndiyabonga
Baie Dankie

May we continue the dialogue and
engage constructively with each other

